



March 16, 2017

Chairman Ajit Pai  
Federal Communications Commission  
445 Twelfth Street, SW  
Washington DC 20554

Re: *Comment on Request for Reconsideration Concerning Lifeline Broadband Providers*,  
WC Docket Nos. 09-197, 11-42

Dear Chairman Pai:

On behalf of The Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights, a coalition charged by its diverse membership of more than 200 national organizations to promote and protect the rights of all persons in the United States and the undersigned supporters of the Lifeline program, we appreciate the opportunity to submit comments in response to the *Request for Reconsideration Concerning Lifeline Broadband Providers*.<sup>1</sup> The civil rights and public interest communities are committed to ensuring that all members of society are connected to modern, advanced communications networks and services, and believe the Lifeline program fills an important role in a comprehensive strategy for bridging the digital divide as it lowers a major barrier to access due to cost. The Wireline Competition Bureau Lifeline Broadband Provider (LBP) revocation order delays an array of innovative and high quality Lifeline broadband offerings and has a chilling effect on other potential Lifeline broadband entrants. The new LBP designation process is critical for increasing competition and facilitating competition and innovation in the Lifeline broadband program, and we urge the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) to resume the designation process immediately.

The FCC developed the LBP designation process because commercial broadband providers maintained the current state-by-state process was a barrier for their Lifeline participation.<sup>2</sup> We support widespread commercial participation to create a highly competitive Lifeline broadband marketplace.<sup>3</sup> The LBP designation process is thoughtful, balanced, and limited, and the current state-by-state process is still operational for companies that offer voice and broadband products.

The companies whose LBP designations were revoked proposed innovative business models providing low cost high quality services for low-income people—exactly the outcome anticipated as part of the Lifeline modernization. For example, included in the nine LBP revocations is a Minority Business Enterprise that offers 300 Mbps download and 150 Mbps upload, as well as unlimited Wi-Fi data with no out-of-pocket charges, caps or overage charges to Lifeline-eligible residents of low-income, senior and mixed-housing developed and managed by a non-profit community developer in Chicago.<sup>4</sup> This LBP is coordinating its Lifeline broadband with digital literacy training and includes a no-charge Wi-Fi enabled devices. Another impacted LBP had partnered with a public housing authority in New York

Officers  
Chair  
Judith L. Lichtman  
National Partnership for  
Women & Families  
Vice Chairs  
Jacqueline Pata  
National Congress of American Indians  
Thomas A. Saenz  
Mexican American Legal  
Defense and Educational Fund  
Hillary Shelton  
NAACP  
Secretary  
Jo Ann Jenkins  
AARP  
Treasurer  
Lee A. Saunders  
American Federation of State,  
County & Municipal Employees

Board of Directors  
Helena Berger  
American Association of  
People with Disabilities  
Cornell William Brooks  
NAACP  
Kristen Clarke  
Lawyers' Committee for  
Civil Rights Under Law  
Lily Eskelsen Garcia  
National Education Association  
Marcia D. Greenberger  
National Women's Law Center  
Chad Griffin  
Human Rights Campaign  
Wylecia Wiggs Harris  
League of Women Voters of the  
United States  
Mary Kay Henry  
Service Employees International Union  
Mark Hopkins  
AAUW  
Sherrilyn Ifill  
NAACP Legal Defense and  
Educational Fund, Inc.  
Michael B. Keegan  
People for the American Way  
Samer E. Khalaf  
American-Arab  
Anti-Discrimination Committee  
Marc Morial  
National Urban League  
Mee Moua  
Asian Americans Advancing Justice |  
AAJC  
Janet Murguía  
National Council of La Raza  
Debra Ness  
National Partnership for  
Women & Families  
Terry O'Neill  
National Organization for Women  
Rabbi Jonah Pesner  
Religious Action Center  
Of Reform Judaism  
Anthony Romero  
American Civil Liberties Union  
Shanna Smith  
National Fair Housing Alliance  
Richard L. Trumka  
AFL-CIO  
Randi Weingarten  
American Federation of Teachers  
Dennis Williams  
International Union, UAW  
William Yoshino  
Japanese American Citizens League

Policy and Enforcement  
Committee Chair  
Michael Lieberman  
Anti-Defamation League  
President & CEO  
Wade J. Henderson  
Executive Vice President & COO  
Karen McGill Lawson



to provide residents with a fixed wireless broadband offering with speeds of 20 Mbps down and 20 Mbps up and no data caps.<sup>5</sup> A third impacted LBP has designed a Lifeline broadband offering to target the homework gap with 4G LTE hotspots with up to 6 GB per month.<sup>6</sup> The Commission's action summarily dismissed these proposals as well as those for mobile wireless providers that offer services to low-income parents looking for work, scheduling interviews, or picking up extra shifts.

We urge the Commission to act quickly on this matter as uncertainty regarding the process for broadband providers to participate in the Lifeline program delays access to affordable broadband to low-income households. Please contact Leadership Conference Media/Telecommunications Task Force Co-Chairs Cheryl Leanza, United Church of Christ, Office of Communication, Inc., at 202-904-2168 or [cleanza@alhmail.com](mailto:cleanza@alhmail.com), or Michael Macleod-Ball, American Civil Liberties Union, at (202) 675-2309 or [mmacleod@aclu.org](mailto:mmacleod@aclu.org) or Corrine Yu, Leadership Conference Managing Policy Director at 202-466-5670 or [yu@civilrights.org](mailto:yu@civilrights.org) if you would like to discuss the above issues.

Sincerely,

The Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights  
American Civil Liberties Union  
American Library Association  
Appalshop, Inc.  
Asian Americans Advancing Justice | AAJC  
Benton Foundation  
Center for Media Justice  
Center for Rural Strategies  
City of Seattle - Community Technology Advisory Board  
Common Cause  
Common Sense Kids Action  
Communications Workers of America  
Connect Your Community  
DANEnet  
Demand Progress  
Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition of Dayton Ohio  
El Centro de la Raza  
EveryoneOn  
Footprints, Inc.  
Get Engaged 2016-2017  
The Greenlining Institute  
Institute for Local Self-Reliance  
Media Alliance  
Media Mobilizing Project  
NAACP  
National Consumer Law Center, on behalf of its low-income clients  
National Digital Inclusion Alliance  
National Hispanic Media Coalition  
New America's Open Technology Institute  
OCA - Asian Pacific American Advocates



Open MIC (Open Media and Information Companies Initiative)  
Oregon Citizens' Utility Board  
Partnership for Progress on the Digital Divide  
Project Appleseed  
Public Knowledge  
United Church of Christ, OC Inc.  
WinstonNet  
X-Lab

cc: Commissioner Clyburn  
Commissioner O'Reilly

---

<sup>1</sup> See *Wireline Competition Bureau Seeks Comment on Request for Reconsideration Concerning Lifeline Broadband Providers*, WC Docket Nos. 09-197, 11-42, DA 17-213 (Rel. Mar. 2, 2017).

<sup>2</sup> See e.g., *Third Report and Order, Further Report and Order, and Order on Reconsideration*, WC Docket Nos. 11-42, 09-197, 10-90 (Apr. 27, 2016) at ¶¶228, 235-236.

<sup>3</sup> Comments of the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights, WC Docket Nos. 11-42, 09-197, 10-90 (filed Aug. 31, 2015) at 2-3.

<sup>4</sup> See *Petition of Applied Research Designs, Inc. for Streamlined Designation as a Lifeline Broadband Provider Eligible Telecommunications Carrier*, WC Docket No. 09-197 (Nov. 30, 2016).

<sup>5</sup> See *Spot On Networks, LLC Petition for Streamlined Designation as a Lifeline Broadband Provider Eligible Telecommunications Carrier*, WC Docket No. 09-197 (Oct. 26, 2016).

<sup>6</sup> See *Kajeet Inc. Petition for Streamlined Designation as a Lifeline Broadband Eligible Telecommunications Carrier*, WC Docket No. 09-197 (Oct. 11, 2016).